

To: "Bob Seal" [rseal@usgs.gov]
Cc: CN=Phil North/OU=R10/O=USEPA/C=US@EPA[]
From: CN=Barbara Butler/OU=CI/O=USEPA/C=US
Sent: Sat 4/7/2012 3:14:05 PM
Subject: Fw: Comments on Section 4 - Authors please address

Hi Bob,

The number 5 comment is on something that derived from your geology write-up. Rather than forward you the entire 8 MB file, I have copied the sentence that the comment regards, as well as the actual comment for you to address. Please send your revised sentence(s) to Phil - thanks!

Sentence: "The rocks associated with porphyry copper deposits, in general, tend to straddle the boundary between being "net acidic" and "net alkaline", which is illustrated by Borden (2003) for the Bingham Canyon, Utah porphyry copper deposit (Figures 4-2 and 4-3), which shares many geologic features with the Pebble deposit.

Comment to address: "Such as? Would be helpful to provide more detail here."

Cheers,
Barb

Barbara A. Butler, PhD
Research Physical Scientist
US EPA-ORD-NRMRL-LRPCD-RRB
26 W. Martin Luther King Drive, MS 489
Cincinnati, OH 45268
Phone: (513) 569-7468
Fax: (513) 569-7620

-----Forwarded by Barbara Butler/CI/USEPA/US on 04/07/2012 11:05AM -----

To: Barbara Butler/CI/USEPA/US@EPA, Jason Todd/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jim Wigington/COR/USEPA/US@EPA, "Seville, Steven" <SSeville@icfi.com>, "Grismala, Ralph" <RGrismala@icfi.com>, Glenn Suter/CI/USEPA/US@EPA
From: Phil North/R10/USEPA/US
Date: 04/04/2012 06:47PM
Cc: Kate Schofield/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Subject: Comments on Section 4 - Authors please address

Attached is Section 4 with comments from various reviewers. We are asking each author to address the comments on their parts. Make changes as appropriate then send the draft back to me. I (or Kate) will compile all the changes in a revised version. We have already made some changes so if you see something different from what you wrote, please make changes as appropriate or leave alone.

I am not sure who the authors are for specific parts of Section 4, so I made an educated guess. If I guessed wrong please let me know, or if you know the correct author please forward and cc me.

Here is my best guess at who needs to respond:
Comment Author(s)
5 Barbara
7 Barbara
8 Barbara

23 Jason or Jim
27 Barbara
31 Jason, Jim or Glen
.50 Jason or Jim
52 Jason or Jim
63 Steve or Ralph
64 - 67 Steve or Ralph
70 Steve

(See attached file: BBA_ERdraft_v1_sec4_comments.docx)

Phillip North
Environmental Protection Agency
Kenai River Center
514 Funny River Road
Soldotna, Alaska 99669
(907) 714-2483
fax 260-5992
north.phil@epa.gov

"To protect your rivers, protect your mountains."